

Final Report No. ST-2024-20031-01

The Potential for Restoring Thermal Refuge in Rivers for Cold-Water Salmonids

 Science and Technology Program Research and Development Office

Mission Statements

 The U.S. Department of the Interior protects and manages the Nation's natural resources and cultural heritage; provides scientific and other information about those resources; honors its trust responsibilities or special commitments to American Indians, Alaska Natives, Native Hawaiians, and affiliated Island Communities.

The mission of the Bureau of Reclamation is to manage, develop, and protect water and related resources in an environmentally and economically sound manner in the interest of the American public.

Disclaimer

 as an endorsement of any product or firm by the Bureau of Reclamation, Department of Interior, or Federal Government. The products evaluated in the report were evaluated for purposes specific evaluated in this report, including merchantability or fitness for a Information in this report may not be used for advertising or promotional purposes. The data and findings should not be construed to the Bureau of Reclamation mission. Reclamation gives no warranties or guarantees, expressed or implied, for the products particular purpose.

Acknowledgements

 sponsored this research. We would also like to thank the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation, the Pacific The Science and Technology Program, Bureau of Reclamation, Northwest Regional Office, and the Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife for substantial in-kind field contributions to this project. We would also like to thank the University of Idaho for work conducting the groundwater modeling for this project and Joel Sholtes from Colorado Mesa University for collaboration on this project.

Final Report No. ST-2024-20031-01

The Potential for Restoring Thermal Refuge in Rivers for Cold-Water Salmonids

Prepared by:

Bureau of Reclamation Technical Service Center Denver, Colorado

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 8/98)
Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39.18

The Potential for Restoring Thermal Refuge in Rivers for Cold-Water Salmonids

AARON HURST HURST

Digitally signed by AARON Date: 2024.03.12 13:48:36 -06'00'

Prepared by: Aaron A. Hurst, Ph.D. Geomorphologist, Sedimentation and River Hydraulics Group, Technical Service Center, 86-68240

Andrew

Digitally signed by Andrew Tranmer
DN: cn=Andrew Tranmer, c=US, Tranmer co-University of Idaho,
Tranmer email=andyt@uidaho.edu
Date: 2024.03.12 15:40:11 -06'00'

Prepared by: Andrew W. Tranmer, Ph.D. Professor, Center for Ecohydraulics Research, University of Idaho

 \textbf{D} aniele Tonin al Barthylande Tonin, estimate (data), ou-Center for the contract of the

Prepared by: Daniele Tonina, Ph.D. Professor, Center for Ecohydraulics Research, University of Idaho

Andrea Bertagnoli signed by Andrea
Bertagnoli Div. cn=Andrea Bertagnoli, c=US,
Bertagnoli Div. cn=Andrea Bertagnoli, c=US,
Div. cn=2024.03.13 14:34:46-06'00'

Prepared by: Andrea Bertagnoli, Ph.D. candidate Center for Ecohydraulics Research, University of Idaho

Jordan

Digitally signed by Jordan Frye
DN: cn=Jordan Frye, c=US, Erve Cate: 2024.03.13 17:59:17 -06'00'

Prepared by: Jordan Frye, M.S. Center for Ecohydraulics Research, University of Idaho

 $\overline{}$

Prepared by: Joel Sholtes, Ph.D. Professor, Colorado Mesa University

Digitally signed by CAROLINE **CAROLINE UBING** Date: 2024.03.12 14:19:03 -06'00'

Prepared by: Caroline Ubing, M.S. Hydraulic Engineer, Client Support Services, Technical Service Center, 86-68010

MICHAEL SIXTA SIXTA 2024.03.12 14:12:13-06'00'

Peer Review by: Michael Sixta, P.E., Hydraulic Engineer, Sedimentation and River Hydraulics Group, Technical Service Center, 86-68240

"This information is distributed solely for the purpose of pre-dissemination peer review under applicable information quality guidelines. It has not been formally disseminated by the Bureau of Reclamation. It does not represent and should not be construed to represent Reclamation's determination or policy."

Executive Summary

 warmer water temperatures, whereas dam releases can input cool water to rivers (Caissie 2006; cold-water species and basin-wide reduction in viable habitat and spawning (Battin et al., 2007; Ruesch et al. 2012). Many cold-water aquatic species recovery programs, therefore, need to consider water temperatures in their restoration efforts by creating thermal refuges. Thermal refuges are areas of a river that buffer, lag, and cool/warm stream temperatures at biologically define thermal refuge as discrete patches of surface water that are cooler than 1 degree Celsius can in turn, affect water temperatures in the main and side channels. Currently, there is little Anthropogenic activities may alter the natural landscape and influence water temperatures to levels outside of historical trends. Channelizing and removing riparian vegetation can result in Justice et al., 2017; Olden & Naiman, 2010). Cold-water aquatic species, like salmonids, require a narrow range of temperature conditions to ensure their survival and support their life history (Konecki et al. 1995; Schindler 1997). High water temperatures can cause localized mortality of relevant scales and times. This water is often warmer in the winter and cooler in the summer (Arrigoni et al. 2008; Torgerson et al. 2012). To address acute summer water temperatures, we $({\rm ^{\circ}C})$ from the reference water temperature. Thermal refuge is typically created by two mechanisms: (1) reducing solar insolation by reducing channel width-to-depth ratios and increasing shading by riparian vegetation and (2) enhancing exchange of surface-subsurface water (i.e., hyporheic exchange) within the channel bed, banks, and floodplain. For this study, we focus on the second mechanism by studying how restoration can alter hyporheic flow, which documentation on the ability and degree to which physical channel and floodplain restoration can influence hyporheic exchange and associated stream ecosystem function (Hester and Gooseff 2010). To improve river and floodplain restoration outcomes, we must develop a better understanding of what mechanisms are capable of generating thermal refuge.

 projects were constructed or are currently in planning phases. Many of these projects have thermal restoration as one of their main objectives, and thus highlight the need for a better studies related to the potential of river restoration to enhance hyporheic exchange have focused on specific structures rather than reach-scale restoration effects on hyporheic and thermal conditions in a river (Hester et al. 2009; Hester and Gooseff 2010; Crispell and Endreny 2009; a designed restoration site. The U.S. Bureau of Reclamation (Reclamation) has been working on habitat restoration in the Grande Ronde basin in Oregon since 2011. Over this period, nearly a dozen river restoration understanding of how physical aspects of restoration directly influence in-channel water temperatures. Many researchers have studied the physical conditions that lead to hyporheic flow, its influence on surface water temperature, and the hydrological processes associated with the hyporheic zone (e.g. Poole et al. 2008; Arrigoni et al. 2008; Hester and Gooseff 2010). To date, Torgersen et al. 2012). This study closes that knowledge gap by applying the connection between hyporheic exchange and thermal refuge to study the efficacy of reach-scale thermal restoration at

The Bird Track Springs Restoration Project is located on the upper Grande Ronde River in northeastern Oregon. The basin hydrology is snowmelt-driven, with annual peak flows of around 900 cubic feet per second (ft^3/s) occurring in April and May and low flows from July through

 typically around -4 °C. Low flows in the summer coupled with the seasonal temperature swings salmonid productivity. This reach was therefore targeted for restoration to remediate the poor habitat quality and encourage an increase in the native fish population. October. Temperatures in the summer reach a typical high of around 30 \degree C and winter lows are result in warm water in the summer and little ice-free area in the winter, which are a concern for

 The pre-restoration river planform was historically straightened (sinuosity of 1.2) for splash-dam logging, and the average annual high flows were contained in the main channel. The main channel had a high width to depth ratio and limited riparian vegetation with fewer than temperatures in the summer and limited ice-free areas in the winter that created thermally stressful conditions for Chinook salmon during summer months (Cardno, 2017). 0.25 miles (mi) of side channels. The restoration design defined one large pool in the study reach, but this pool was less than 2 ft deep during low flow and was not considered in this study. Only 60 acres of floodplain were connected to the channel. This resulted in high water

 Because of the warm water temperature conditions, Reclamation restored the channel from engineers excavated 5,000 linear feet (ft) of new main channel and 9,500 ft of side channel to increase the sinuosity to 1.4, an additional 135 acres of floodplain were reconnected to the active installed as part of the riparian restoration effort. Additionally, alcoves, riffles, point bars, glides, 2017 to December of 2019. The goals of the restoration effort were to increase surfacegroundwater exchange between the channel and floodplain and provide thermal refuge for migratory and resident Chinook salmon during critical summer months. During restoration, channel with 439 pieces of large woody material placed per mi, and over 15,000 plants were and 19 large pools were added within the main channel (Childs et al., 2020).

 throughout the reach and provide an opportunity to study morphologically induced hyporheic The post-restoration channel exhibits much greater morphologic heterogeneity and diversity than the pre-restoration channel. Unit scale and planform geomorphic features were incorporated exchange.

This study aims to answer two key questions:

- 1. How do stream and floodplain rehabilitation practices create or enhance thermal refuge at different spatial scales?
- 2. Can thermal refuge restoration be accomplished in a manner that is ecologically relevant to target species?

 subsurface hydrologic connectivity. We test the hypothesis that hyporheic flow paths can be temperatures at hourly timescales while planform-scale restoration work has the potential to buffer or lag water temperatures at longer timescales (days to months) due to the different To answer these questions, this study requires looking at mechanisms of buffering, lagging, and cooling of water temperature provided by hydrologic connections between surface and enhanced by restoration measures at geomorphic unit and planform scales. The design expectation is that unit-scale geomorphic features are expected to buffer or lag surface water

 flowpath lengths. Specifically, longer hyporheic flowpaths that result from planform-scale the channel tend to be cooler during the summer because they trend toward the groundwater features provide a longer duration of subsurface interactions. The inputs from these flowpaths to temperature. This will result in an increase in thermal refuge with localized small fluxes of cooled water, but net cooling is not expected in the reach.

 exchange within the hyporheic zone. We compare results between pre- and post-restoration scenarios to assess the performance of specific constructed morphologic features in inducing University of Idaho, and Colorado Mesa University. This study combined field data collection efforts, two-dimensional surface water modeling using the Sedimentation and River Hydraulics Two-Dimensional model (SRH-2D), and threedimensional groundwater modeling using MODFLOW to assess the extent of hydraulic hyporheic exchange. The hypothesis is that by increasing subsurface connectivity and hyporheic exchange, the channel exhibits greater thermal refuge. The field work and modeling efforts were a collaboration between the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation (CTUIR), the Reclamation's Pacific Northwest Regional Office, Snake River Area Office (SRAO), and Technical Service Center (TSC), the Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife (ODFW), the

 model, we collected surface-water discharge, groundwater levels and temperatures in observation through fall). Due to vandalism, only 14 of the hyporheic flux probes were recovered. To evaluate spatial temperature trends and establish boundary conditions for the groundwater wells, and surface-water temperatures during the timeframe used in the modeling efforts. The SRAO Geology group assessed the range of hydraulic conductivities present in the floodplain through field slug tests in a subset of wells in August 2021 to help constrain the groundwater model parameters. Collaborators from the University of Idaho designed and installed 40 hyporheic flux probes, 1 atmospheric sensor, and 3 piezometers throughout the channel and floodplain to monitor groundwater conditions and hydraulic fluxes along the stream bed and near prominent morphology. They also developed a way to assess spatial variations in water temperatures within the channel by affixing temperature and pressure sensors to Real Time Kinematic Global Positioning Units. They used these units to conduct longitudinal thermal surveys in early August 2021 to measure near-bed water temperatures and identify areas of potential thermal refuge within the main and side channels. CTUIR deployed HOBO temperature TidbiTs every year to assess water temperatures in the river during ice-free periods (spring

 calibration, the model reproduced both water levels and hyporheic exchange within the river with The MODFLOW groundwater model was coupled with SRH-2D to calculate groundwater flow and track flowpaths through the floodplain and alluvium using MODPATH. The model consisted of six subsurface layers that were informed by the available geophysical survey and well log data. Boundary conditions for the pre- and post-restoration channels were informed by the well and piezometer water table elevation data. Surface water elevations from SRH-2D during a characteristic summer low-flow condition provided the static head condition within the river channel for the model. Model calibration was conducted using the well and piezometer data from the floodplain and the hyporheic flux probes in the riverbed, as well as visual comparison between standing water in the floodplain from aerial imagery and numerical model results. After a mean error of 0.477 ft.

 Groundwater modeling results were assessed by comparing the pre- and post-restoration results. wider area in the valley. This resulted in water table elevations increasing by almost 2.5 ft in the channel in the down-valley direction (East) and bypassed most of the river domain, while post- restoration flowpaths were more sinuous and skewed to the South. This resulted in more The results show that channel realignment post-restoration distributes the surface water over a middle section of the channel. It also changed the local gradient of subsurface flows and the direction of flowpaths through the valley. Pre-restoration flowpaths largely ran parallel to the intersection of the channel with the flowpaths, which increased lateral influxes of upwelling in parts of the river. Flowpath lengths were also on average 2.5 times longer post-restoration, resulting in longer residence times of water in the hyporheic zone, increasing the possibility for thermal buffering of instream water temperatures. Average subsurface residence times were 300 days (~10 months) pre-restoration and 750 days (~2 years) post-restoration. Residence times less than 20 days were about the same pre- and post-restoration, and the upper end of the distribution (residence times $>5,000$ days or \sim 13.5 years) were longer pre-restoration.

 force groundwater upwelling at the upstream end of the valley where bedrock underlies the channel, and at the downstream end where the channel abuts the canyon wall. These valley-scale influences persist in pre- and post-restoration conditions. Within these valley-scale influences, riffles) during restoration. Pool-riffle sequences generate a structured distribution of downwelling at pool tails and riffles and upwelling at pool heads. Plane bed features have random distributions of upwelling and downwelling and accounted for most of the pre-restoration channel. The position of the feature relative to the valley-scale groundwater the river channel relative to the valley groundwater gradient, hyporheic exchange can shift away riffles and can limit the efficacy of morphologic-driven hyporheic exchange. Further, if the the water surface elevation in the channel). Therefore, the construction of morphologic features can generate predictable hyporheic exchange in the channel, but the hyporheic response in each The model further showed that morphologic features and valley-scale influences (bedrock/geologic constraints) can affect upwelling and downwelling. Valley-scale influences hyporheic exchange changes after restoration due to constructed morphologic features (pools and gradient dictates the spatial distribution of hyporheic exchange. Depending on the orientation of from pool heads and tails to cross-channel pool margins. This effect is present but less notable in feature is located in a losing reach (water table below the channel water surface elevation), less upwelling and greater downwelling occurs and vice versa if in a gaining reach (water table above feature will depend on both the valley-scale groundwater direction and adjacent water table elevation.

 Comparing sections of the channel that maintained the same water surface slope pre- and post- restoration indicate that pool-riffle morphologies are able to generate net hyporheic discharge magnitudes 300 percent greater than those in the pre-restoration channel's weirs and riffles. In hyporheic discharge as the steep pre-restoration channel. Further, restoration increased total downwelling by 19percent and upwelling by 16percent relative to the pre-restoration channel, indicating overall greater hyporheic exchange in the post-restoration channel. Net gains and lower slope channel sections, pool-riffle sequences were able to generate similar magnitudes of losses were similar between the two channels over the length of the reach.

For thermal habitat conditions, water temperatures in excess of 25 \degree C are lethal to many (percent) (0.24 ft³/s) to 1.27 percent (0.27 f^{t3}/s) of the typical late summer discharge in the the capacity to reduce mean water temperature in the channel by only 0.12 °C. However, no warmed 2-3 °C over the length of the reach, with the typical maximum daily water temperature exceeding 25 °C [\(figure 1\)](#page-12-0). The cumulative time spent over the 25 °C threshold was reduced by significantly affect the bulk temperatures in the channel. Examination of hyporheic discharge to timescale flowpaths have a mean temperature of 11 °C, which is capable of cooling the stream discharges in this category decreased by 19percent after restoration. Flowpaths with an annual hyporheic discharge and its limited post-restoration cooling potential indicates that some other salmonids. Restoration increased the total upwelling discharge to the channel from 1.10 percent Grande Ronde River restoration reach. Accounting for this percentage, hyporheic discharge has change in mean water temperature was observed through the reach after restoration. In comparison, maximum daily water temperatures were affected. In both the pre-restoration and post-restoration channel during summer low-flow conditions, the peak temperatures entering the upstream end of the reach often exceed 25 °C. In the pre-restoration channel, water temperatures 75percent between the upstream and downstream boundary after restoration. This reach-scale buffering that reduced maximum daily temperatures is unlikely to be from hyporheic exchange because the hyporheic fluxes in the channel are of low magnitude and have limited potential to the channel with specific ranges of residence times shows that the mean water temperatures of upwelling flows with a week-timescale flowpath is 21.4 \degree C, which is not low enough to reduce the river temperature but could provide a thermally constant input to moderate minimum and maximum daily temperatures if fluxes were high enough. Hyporheic discharges with monthwater because it is less than the minimum daily summer temperature. However, hyporheic timescale have a mean water temperature of 9 °C and were increased by 16percent after restoration. However, measured hyporheic discharge entering the river channel was limited owing to the low hydraulic conductivity of the valley sediments. The low magnitude of mechanism must be responsible for the reach-scale thermal buffering seen at Bird Track Springs.

 Springs reach. Nighttime pool filling with cool water from upstream creates cool pool the day, shearing of the stratified thermal boundary of each pool serves to export cool water from the pool bottoms downstream. This phenomenon can reduce the duration of lethal conditions at discharges $(<$ 30 ft³/s at Bird Track Springs). To link the concepts of pool volume and reach is greater than 3 hours, thermal buffering becomes influential within the study site. This Thermal pool stratification can explain the reach-scale thermal buffering in the Bird Track temperatures at the beginning of each day. As surface waters warm from solar insolation during the bottoms of individual pools and cumulatively at the reach scale, but cannot reverse the lethal conditions entering at the upstream boundary over the reach analyzed here. Further, pool stratification is flow-dependent and only has the capability to impact thermal buffering at low streamflow, we show that when the cumulative hydraulic residence time of all the pools in the suggests that pool stratification only affects reach-scale water temperatures at very low-flow conditions in the Grande Ronde River.

sometimes exceed the 25 °C threshold in summer. On average, temperatures remain well above 18 °C stress threshold for Chinook from June to late August, and then late June to early August can exceed the migration barrier and mortality. Refuge was measured in discrete patches within number of thermal refuge measurements, followed by riffles, spring channels, the pool downstream of the backfilled channel, alcoves, and plane bed features. Low magnitude hyporheic fluxes during summer conditions had limited impact on water temperatures in the channel and thermal refuge, but some features could retain those fluxes to facilitate refuge. their spatial extent. On average, pools cooled water by $0.5 \degree C$, riffles increased temperatures by 0.48 °C, and plane bed features increased temperatures by 0.4 °C. Without riparian vegetation to shade the channel, spring channels had limited ability to cool the temperatures in the main main channel, thereby making them ineffective for thermal buffering. Field observations tested for the presence of thermal refuge in the Bird Track Springs restoration reach. The observations showed mean daily surface water temperatures vary seasonally and morphologic features and depended on their location within the channel. Pools had the greatest Further, specific morphologic features generated longitudinal changes in water temperature over channel. Cool groundwater inputs to spring channels were warmed by the time they joined the

 evaluate the hydraulic conductivity of floodplain sediments and existing hyporheic fluxes in the features like alcoves and spring channels, riparian shading and increased flow depth would Future restoration projects targeting increased hyporheic flow for thermal benefits should channel during the design phase to assess the potential for using channel morphology to increase subsurface flows. The limited hyporheic discharge proved insufficient to generate cool-water patches in the channel without a morphologic feature to retain those cool inputs. For example, measured upwelling fluxes where the channel had a plane bed or riffle morphology resulted in no observed thermal refuge, irrespective of the flux magnitude. In contrast, pool features with lower magnitude fluxes often had thermal refuge present. Thus, the low-magnitude hyporheic discharge may constitute only a limited part of the mechanics generating thermal refuge in these features, and other physical mechanisms like cool nighttime filling and thermal daytime stratification in pools provide the primary driver of thermal refuge. In smaller morphologic improve potential for generating thermal refuge.

 Figure ES-1.—Hourly surface water temperatures from a) tidbits from upstream and downstream of the pre-restoration reach in 2016 and b) tidbits and temperature probes between the upstream and downstream gages in the post-restoration channel in 2021. Post- restoration water temperatures exhibit thermal buffering from upstream and downstream. Increasing channel numbers represent increased longitudinal distance in the channel.

References

- 2008 Buffered, lagged, or cooled? Disentangling hyporheic influences on temperature cycles in stream channels. *Water Resources Research*, *44*(9). cycles in stream channels. Water Resources Research, 44(9). Arrigoni, A. S., Poole, G. C., Mertes, L. A., O'Daniel, S. J., Woessner, W. W., & Thomas, S. A.
- Battin, J., Wiley, M.W., Ruckelshaus, M.H., Palmer, R.N., Korb, E., Bartz, K.K. and Imaki, H. (2007). Projected impacts of climate change on salmon habitat restoration. *Proceedings of the national academy of sciences,* 104(16), pp.6720–6725.
- Caissie, D. (2006). The thermal regime of rivers: a review. *Freshwater biology*, *51*(8), 1389– 1406.
- Carno, Inc. (2017). Basis of Design Report: Draft Final (95 percent) Bird Track Springs Habitat Improvement Project. *Prepared for Bureau of Reclamation by Cardno, Inc.*
- Childs, A., Kimbro, J., Dixon, T., and Mack, D. (2020). CTUIR Grande Ronde Subbasin Restoration Project Report. Prepared by the Confederated Tribes Umatilla Indian Reservation for NPPC Project #199608300.
- Crispell, J. K., & Endreny, T. A. (2009). Hyporheic exchange flow around constructed in‐ channel structures and implications for restoration design. *Hydrological Processes: An International Journal*, *23*(8), 1158-1168.
- Hester, E. T., Doyle, M. W., & Poole, G. C. (2009). The influence of in-stream structures on summer water temperatures via induced hyporheic exchange. *Limnology and Oceanography*, *54*(1), 355-367.
- Hester, E. T., & Gooseff, M. N. (2010). Moving beyond the banks: Hyporheic restoration is fundamental to restoring ecological services and functions of streams. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2010, 44, 5, 1521–1525.
- stream and riparian restoration offset climate change impacts to salmon populations?. Journal of Justice, C., White, S. M., McCullough, D. A., Graves, D. S., & Blanchard, M. R. (2017). Can populations?. *Journal of Environmental Management*, *188*, 212-227.
- Konecki, J.T., Woody, C.A. and Quinn, T.P. (1995). Temperature preference in two populations of juvenile coho salmon, Oncorhynchus kisutch. *Environmental Biology of fishes*, 44(4), pp.417–421.
- Olden, J., & Naiman, R. (2010) . Incorporating thermal regimes into environmental flows assessments: modifying dam operations to restore freshwater ecosystem integrity. *Freshwater Biology, 55*(1), 86-107.
- & Beechie, T. J. (2008). Hydrologic spiralling: the role of multiple interactive flow paths Poole, G. C., O'daniel, S. J., Jones, K. L., Woessner, W. W., Bernhardt, E. S., Helton, A. M., ... in stream ecosystems. *River Research and Applications*, *24*(7), 1018-1031.
- Ruesch, A.S., Torgersen, C.E., Lawler, J.J., Olden, J.D., Peterson, E.E., Volk, C.J. and Lawrence, D.J. (2012). Projected climate-induced habitat loss for salmonids in the John Day river network, Oregon, USA. *Conservation Biology*, 26(5), pp.873-882.
- Schindler, D.W. (1997). Widespread effects of climatic warming on freshwater ecosystems in North America. *Hydrological Processes*, 11(8), pp.1043-1067.
- Washington under EPA Interagency Agreement No. DW-14-95755001-0. Torgersen, C. E., Ebersole, J. L., & Keenan, D. M. (2012). Primer for identifying cold-water refuges to protect and restore thermal diversity in riverine landscapes. Report EPA 910- C-12-001 prepared for Region 10, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Seattle,